

**TRANSITIONING FROM DOCTORAL STUDENT TO ACADEMIC
PROFESSIONAL: A CRITICAL REFLECTION ON THE VALUE OF
MENTORSHIP IN HIGHER EDUCATION**

Keisha Samlal*

The University of the West Indies, St. Augustine Campus

Abstract: *Mentorship in higher education is valuable in the transition process from doctoral studies to an academic career. A doctoral degree is insufficient to properly qualify doctoral candidates for entry into the professional academic space. This paper utilizes a reflective approach to discuss the role and importance of supervisory mentorship in the transitional process from doctoral student to academic professional. From the perspective of a PhD student mentee, the paper firstly articulates an in-depth narrative of the personal challenges, fears and anxieties experienced in negotiating the convergence of academic and professional development. Secondly, the paper critically discusses the role of a supervisory mentoring relationship in navigating these difficulties experienced by the mentee and the importance of supporting the doctoral candidate throughout the process. Finally, the paper interrogates the importance of dyadic, hierarchical faculty mentoring arrangements to the transition process from doctoral candidate to academic professional.*

Keywords: *doctoral supervision; supervisory mentoring; mentoring; PhD; higher education*

* Corresponding Author (Kc_samlal@yahoo.com)

ISSN 1727-5512

Copyright © School of Education, The University of the West Indies Cave Hill (2023)

REFERENCES

- Al Makhamreh, M., & Stockley, D. (2019). Mentorship and well-being: Examining doctoral students' lived experiences in doctoral supervision context. *International Journal of Mentoring and Coaching in Education*, 9, 1-20. 10.1108/IJMCE-02-2019-0013.
- Arora, R., & Rangnekar, S. (2015). Relationships between emotional stability, psychosocial mentoring support, and career resilience. *Europe's Journal of Psychology*, 11, 16-33. 10.5964/ejop.v11i1.835.
- Baker, V. L., & Pifer, M. J. (2011). The role of relationships in the transition from doctoral student to independent scholar. *Studies in Continuing Education*, 33, 5-17. 10.1080/0158037X.2010.515569.
- Baptista, A. V. (2011). Challenges to doctoral research and supervision quality: A theoretical approach. *Procedia Social and Behavioural Sciences*, 15, 3576-3581. 10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.04.338.
- Bastalich, W. (2015). Content and context in knowledge production: A critical review of doctoral supervision literature. *Studies in Higher Education*, 42, 1145-1157. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2015.1079702>.
- Blau, F. D., Currie, J. M., Croson, R. T. A., & Ginther, D. K. (2010). Can mentoring help female assistant professors? Interim results from a randomized trial. Working Paper *National Bureau of Economic Research*.
- Bloom, G., Durand-Bush, N., Schinke, R., & John, S. (1998). The importance of mentoring in the development of coaches and athletes. *International Journal of Sport Psychology*, 29, 268-281.
- Boncori, I., & Smith, C. (2020). Negotiating the doctorate as an academic professional: Identity work and sensemaking through autoethnographic methods. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 25, 271-285. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2018.1561436>.
- Britner, P. A., Balcazar, F. E., Blechman, E. A., Blinn-Pike, L., & Larose, S. (2006). Mentoring special youth populations. *Journal of Community Psychology*, 34, 747-763. 10.1002/jcop.20127.
- Chandler, C. (1996). Mentoring and women in academic: Reevaluating the traditional model. *National Women's Studies Association Journal*, 3, 79-100.

- Chang, H., Longman, K. A., & Franco, M. A. (2014). Leadership development through mentoring in higher education: A collaborative autoethnography of leaders of color. *Mentoring and Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*, 22, 373-389. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13611267.2014.945734>.
- Choi, E., Park, J., Jo, K., & Lee, O. (2015). The influence of a sports mentoring programme on children's life skills development. *Journal of Physical Education and Sport*, 15, 264-271. 10.7752/jpes.2015.02040.
- Christie, H. (2014). Peer mentoring in higher education: Issues of power and control. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 19, 955-965. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2014.934355>.
- Chua, W. J., Wei Shuen, C., Lee, F. Q. H., Koh, E. Y. H., Toh, Y. P., Mason, S., & Krishna, L. K. R. (2020). Structuring mentoring in medicine and surgery. A systematic scoping review of mentoring programmes between 2000 and 2019. *Journal of Continuing Education in the Health Professions*, 40, 158-168. 10.1097/CEH.0000000000000308.
- Colvin, J. W., & Ashman, M. (2010). Roles, risks, and benefits of peer mentoring relationships in higher education. *Mentoring and Tutoring: Partnership in Learning*, 18, 121-134. 10.1080/13611261003678879.
- Crisp, G., & Cruz, I. (2009). Mentoring college students: A critical review of the literature between 1990 and 2007. *Research in Higher Education*, 50, 525-545.
- Darwin, A., & Palmer, E. (2009). Mentoring circles in higher education. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 28, 125-136. 10.1080/07294360902725017.
- Denis, C., Colet, N. R., & Lison, C. (2019). Doctoral supervision in North America: Perceptions and challenges of supervisor and supervisee. *Higher Education Studies*, 9, 30-39. 10.5539/hes.v9n1p30.
- Doloriert, C., Sambrook, S., & Stewart, J. (2012). Power and emotion in doctoral supervision: Implications for HRD. *European Journal of Training and Development*, 36, 732-750. <https://doi.org/10.1108/03090591211255566>.
- DuBois, D. L., & Rhodes, J. E. (2006). Introduction to the special issue: Youth mentoring: Bridging science with practice. *Journal of Community Psychology*, 34, 647-655. 10.1002/jcop.20121.

- Dunn, D., Gerlach, J. M., & Hyle, A. E. (2014). Gender and leadership: Reflection of women in higher education administration. *International Journal of Leadership and Change*, 2, 9-18.
- Fairhurst, K. E., Bloom, G. A., & Harvey, W. J. (2017). The learning and mentoring experiences of paralympic coaches. *Disability and Health Journal*, 10, 240-246. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dhjo.2016.10.007>.
- Freedman, S. (2009). Effective mentoring. *IFLA Journal*, 35, 171-182. 10.1177/0340035209105672.
- Green, S. G., & Bauer, T. A. (1995). Supervisory mentoring by advisers: Relationships with doctoral student potential, productivity, and commitment. *Personnel Psychology*, 48, 537-562.
- Gregoric, C., & Wilson, A. (2015). Informal peer mentoring in early career researchers: A complex adaptive systems (CAS) perspective. *International Journal for Researcher Development*, 6, 40-56. 10.1108/IJRD-08-2014-0020.
- Hall, L. A., & Burns, L. D. (2009). Identity development and mentoring in doctoral education. *Harvard Educational Review*, 79, 49-70.
- Halse, C., & Malfroy, J. (2010). Retheorizing doctoral supervision as professional work. *Studies in Higher Education*, 35, 79-92. 10.1080/03075070902906798.
- Harvey, M., Ambler, T., & Cahir, J. (2017). Spectrum approach to mentoring: An evidence-based approach to mentoring for academics working in higher education. *Teacher Development*, 21, 160-174. <https://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13664530.2016.1210537>.
- Hayes, E., & Balcazar, F. (2008). Peer-mentoring and disability: Current applications and future directions. In T. Kroll (Ed.), *Focus on disability: Trends in research and application* (pp. 89-108). Nova Science Publishers.
- Kahle-Piasecki, L. (2011). Making a mentoring relationship work: What is required for organizational success. *Journal of Applied Business and Economics*, 12, 46-56.
- Kahle-Piasecki, L. & Doles, S. (2015). A comparison of mentoring in higher education and Fortune 1000 companies: Practices to apply in a global context. *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, 15 (5), 74-79.
- Kram, K. (1983). Phases of the mentor relationship. *Academy of Management Journal*, 26, 608-625.

- Kram, K. E., & Isabella, L. A. (1985). Mentoring alternatives: The role of peer relationships in career development. *The Academy of Management Journal*, 28, 110-132.
- Lechuga, V. M. (2011). Faculty-graduate student mentoring relationships: Mentors' perceived roles and responsibilities. *Higher Education*, 62, 757-771. 10.1007/s10734-011-9416-0.
- Linden, J., Ohlin, M., & Brodin, E. M. (2013). Mentorship, supervision and learning in PhD education. *Studies in Higher Education*, 38, 639-662. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2011.596526>.
- Lumpkin, A. (2011). A model for mentoring university faculty. *The Educational Forum*, 75, 357-368. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00131725.2011.602466>.
- Maor, D., Ensor, J. D., & Fraser, B. J. (2016). Doctoral supervision in virtual spaces: A review of research of web-based tools to develop collaborative supervision. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 35, 172-188. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2015.1121206>.
- Masek, A., & Alias, M. (2020). A review of effective doctoral supervision: What is it and how can we achieve it? *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8, 2493-2500. 10.13189/ujer.2020.080633.
- Melrose, S. (2006). Mentoring online graduate students: Partners in scholarship. *Education for Primary Care*, 17, 57-62.
- Merga, M. K., & Mason, S. (2021). Mentor and peer support for early career researchers sharing research with academia and beyond. *Heliyon*, 7, 1-10. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e06172>.
- Miller, M. T., & Deggs, D. (2012). The changing paradigm of graduate student professional socialization and mentoring in graduate adult education programmes. *Journal of Faculty Development*, 26, 24-28.
- Mortari, L. (2015). Reflectivity in research practice: An overview of different perspectives. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 1-9. 10.1177/1609406915618045.
- Mullen, C. A. (2000). Constructing co-mentoring partnerships: Walkways we must travel. *Theory into Practice*, 39, 4-11.

- Murphy, N. A., & Wibberley, C. (2017). Development of an academic identity through PhD supervision: An issue for debate. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 22, 63-65. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nepr.2016.12.002>.
- Ndayambaje, I. (2018). Effect of supervision on timely completion of PhD programme. *Rwandan Journal of Education*, 4, 57-70.
- Paglis, L. L., Green, S. G., & Bauer, T. N. (2006). Does advisor mentoring add value? A longitudinal study of mentoring and doctoral student outcomes. *Research in Higher Education*, 7, 451-476.
- Pearson, M., & Brew, A. (2002). Research training and supervision development. *Studies in Higher Education*, 27, 135-150. 10.1080/03075070220119986.
- Phillips, E. M., & Pugh, D. S. (2005). *How to get a PhD: A handbook for students and their supervisors*. Open University Press.
- Picariello, M., & Waller, S. N. (2016). The importance of role modeling in mentoring women: Lessons from Pat Summitt Legacy. *Physical Culture and Sport Studies Research*, 71, 5-13. <https://doi.org/10.1515/pcssr-2016-0017>.
- Ragins, B. R., & Cotton, J. L. (1999). Mentor functions and outcomes: A comparison of men and women in formal and informal mentoring relationships. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 84, 529-550.
- Ragins, B. R., & Kram, K. E. (2007). *The handbook of mentoring at work: Theory, research, and practice*. Sage.
- Ramnanan, R. A., Phillips, R. S., Roger, D. B., Silen, W., & Joan, R. Y. (2002). Mentoring in medicine: Keys to satisfaction. *APM Association of Professors of Medicine*, 112, 336-341. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0002-9343\(02\)01032-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0002-9343(02)01032-X).
- Ratnapalan, S. (2010). Mentoring in medicine. *Canadian Family Physician*, 56, 198.
- Richards, K. A. R., & Fletcher, T. (2018). Learning to work together: Conceptualizing doctoral supervision as critical friendship. *Sport, Education and Society*, 25, 98-110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13573322.2018.1554561>.
- Rosser, V. K. (2004). The socialization and mentoring of doctoral students: A faculty imperative. *Educational Perspectives*, 37, 28-33.

- Ryan, M. (2011). Improving reflective writing in higher education: A social semiotic perspective. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 16, 99-111. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2010.507311>.
- Sangganjanavanich, V. F., & Magnuson, S. (2009). Averting role confusion between doctoral students and major advisers: Adviser disclosure statements. *Counselor Education & Supervision*, 48, 194-203. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6978.2009.tb00074.x>.
- Sawiuk, R., Taylor, W. G., & Groom R. (2018). Exploring formalized elite coach mentoring programmes in the UK: 'We've had to play the game'. *Sport Education and Society*, 26, 619-631. 10.1080/13573322.2016.1248386.
- Scandura, T. A., & Pellegrini, E. K. (2010). Workplace mentoring: Theoretical approaches and methodological issues. In Allen T. D., & Eby, L. T. (Eds.), *The Blackwell handbook of mentoring: A multiple perspectives approach* (pp. 71-92). Blackwell.
- Scandura, T. A., & Williams, E. A. (2004). Mentoring and transformational leadership: The role of supervisory career mentoring. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 65, 448-468. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2003.10.003>.
- Schunk, D. H., & Mullen, C. A. (2013). Toward a conceptual model of mentoring research: Integration with self-regulated learning. *Educational Psychology Review*, 25, 361-389. 10.1007/s10648-0139233-3.
- Tenenbaum, H. R., Crosby, F. J., & Gliner, M. D. (2001). Mentoring relationships in graduate school. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 59, 326-341. 10.1006/jvbe.2001.1804.
- Waters, L., McCabe, M., Kiellerup, D., & Kiellerup, S. (2002). The role of formal mentoring in business success and self-esteem on participants of a new business start-up programme. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 17, 107-121.
- Watts, J. H. (2009). From professional to PhD student: Challenges of status transition. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 14, 687-691. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562510903315357>.
- Webb, A. K., Wangmo, T., Ewen, H. H., Teaster, P. B., & Hatch, L. R. (2009). Peer and faculty mentoring for students pursuing a PhD in gerontology. *Educational Gerontology*, 35, 1089-1106. 10.1080/03601270902917869.

Winchester-Seeto, T., Homewood, J., Thogersen, J., Jacenyik-Trawoger, C., Manathunga, C., Reid, A., & Holdbrook, A. (2013). *Higher Education Research and Development*, 33, 610-626. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2013.841648>.